Communication errors and patient safety in English as a lingua franca health care settings

Languages Canada 2016 Conference

Fairmont Empress Hotel Victoria, BC

Friday, March 4, 2016 [10:00-11:00]

Gregory M. Tweedie, PhD
IFP, Werklund School of Education
University of Calgary





Co-researcher: Robert C. Johnson, PhD Nursing Foundations Program University of Calgary - Qatar



A story from the Arabian Gulf . . .

a: Where is this?

The origin of this study: On a visit to an outpatient clinic in Qatar, I observed: a pharmacist from India deciphering the instructions of a Filipino doctor to a Qatari patient, mediated through a Sri Lankan nurse - all using English



State of Qatar population (2012): 1.8 million

- Qatari citizens 15%
- India 24%
- Nepal 16%
- Philippines 11%
- non- Qatari Arabs 13%

(Paschyn, 2012)

Where we are today

- International patterns of labour migration move health care workers across a global market (Packer, Labonte & Runnels, 2009).
- 2. English holds a (still growing) monopoly as the linguistic vehicle for medical use (Maher, 1987).
- 3. Different *varieties* of English meet in health care contexts.
- 4. In the Arabian Peninsula English as a lingua franca (ELF) interactions are a daily occurrence (Almutairi & McCarthy,

2012; El-Haddad, 2006).

5. ELF interactions in the Arabian Peninsula have led to concerns over patient medication errors (Bladd, 2008).

Turn to the person beside you. For 2 minutes, discuss this question.

Q: OK, SO YOU're a Language Teacher, <u>not</u> a medical researcher. How are You going to design a study that measures **intelligibility** of DIFFERENT Varieties of English in

Health care settings?



Greg's observation: an Indian pharmacist deciphered the instructions of a Filipino doctor to a Qatari patient, mediated through a Sri Lankan nurse - all using English

Bahrain Qatar

Saudi Arabia

The research study: Data collection

Senior nursing
instructor designs a
health assessment
scenario
(scenarios common in
nursing education, see
Carter & Dickieson,
2010; Zunzarren &
Rodriquez-Sedano,
2011)

Two practicing nurses discuss the scenario

- Nurse A: selfidentifies L1 as
 Tamil
- Nurse B: selfidentifies L1 as
 Arabic

Discussion recorded

14 nursing **students listen** to the recording

- answer
 comprehension
 questions
 (constructed
 following Buck,
 2001)
- results analyzed



3 nursing **instructors** listen to the recording

- semi-structured interviews ask whether patient safety affected
- interviews recorded, transcribed for analysis

Research questions:

- In a **lingua franca** context among different **varieties** of **English**, to what extent was a discussion of a **health** assessment **scenario** by two nursing students **intelligible** to other nursing students?
- In the judgement of nursing instructors, to what extent could issues of intelligibility among users of different varieties of English affect the quality and safety of patient care?



Data analysis - background (scenario)

Scenario Role	Played by	Self-identified 'mother tongue'	Selected linguistic feature	Examples
Hospital nurse going off-shift	Nurse A (*post-diploma degree student; practicing hospital nurse)	Tamil (exhibited features of pan-Indian English: Silaja, 2009; 2012)	 - /w/ and /v/ non-distinction - absence /eɪ/ dipthong - preference for progressive verb forms 	- He has /wpm.itid/ twice today - /hə.ləʊs/ around the lights - he's telling that way
Hospital nurse coming on-shift	Nurse B (*post-diploma degree student; practicing hospital nurse)	Arabic	- lack of do- support in question forms	You not take blood sugar?No any interferon?This refer the file?

Data analysis: background (listeners)

Listeners: Research participant profile			
Gender	14 females; all completed institution's nursing health assessment course		
self-identified 'strongest language'	Arabic (5); Tagalog (3); Farsi (2); Malayalam (2); Yoruba (1); Indonesian (1)		
English proficiency level	Institutional requirements: Foundation entrance requires TOEFL iBT 40, IELTS 4.0; degree entrance requires TOEFL iBT 80, IELTS 6.0		

use your intuitive powers ...

Q: (Using your powers of intuition, answer this question with a partner.) When the recorded health scenario is played to these students, what will the **results** be?



Results: Listening comprehension

Question #	Information given in recorded discussion	Number of incorrect responses /14	Incorrect response (number)
Q1: How old is the patient?	'84 years old'	4/14	- unanswered (3) - '40 years old' (1)
Q4: The patient's pulse is 92. Is there any other information given about the pulse?	ʻirregular'	13/14	- 'regular' (13)
Q5: How is the patient's blood sugar?	ʻblood sugar, not take'	5/14	- 'normal' (3) - 'within normal' (1) - 'good' (1)

Variance in listener comprehension - selected examples

Results: Perception of comprehension

Question #	Responses (14 listeners)
Q7: How well did you understand the patient's condition and symptoms?	easily (7) understood, but with some difficulty (7)
Q8: How much of what the nurses said did you understand?	90% or more (6) 70-89% (7) 50-69% (1)

'In general was OK, not very difficult, but the way they pronounce and the accent is little bit made the word meaning to change, but because we had a lot of experience in working with Indian nurse so it became a habit to hear it and I feel it's OK and easy to understand.'

[Sic]

['strongest language' – Farsi]

Q: As a patient, which would you find more troubling:

- That they didn't understand?
- Or that they didn't understand that they didn't understand?

Results: What did nursing instructors say?

- → Nursing instructors X and Y (pseudonyms) identified areas in the recorded scenario where language intelligibility could affect patient safety.
- → X and Y indicated concern about intelligibility in the reports of administered medications (medication name, dosage amount, dosage frequency). [Z noted these also, but felt her cardiac ward background may have helped inference.]
- → X, Y and Z all indicated concern that lack of precision in expression might negatively impact patient safety.

- Semi-structured interviews
- Recorded
- Transcribed
- Coded for analysis (NVivo)



Results: What did nursing instructors say?

Nursing Instructor Y: So then she talked about air entry, she talked about a moist cough. I would be concerned about this patient because of the KCL, and the high potassium . . . umm . . . And then so the other confusing part about this was that they said that this person is disoriented, but they're responding well. So I don't know what they're responding well to. If they're disoriented, and they're crazy, and they're acting funny, then to me, responding well is a bit of a misnomer.

Interviewer: Would would someone being a native speaker of English use responding well in an unclear kind of way?

Nursing Instructor Y: I don't - I would hope not.

Interviewer: So it might be language?

Nursing Instructor Y: It might be language. I think maybe they're responding well physically, but they've got a whole other psychodynamic going on here, that I'm concerned about. And if their potassium is is creeping up, then they're not actually responding well, you need to attend to the potassium cos that could kill them.



Results: What did nursing *instructors* say?

Nursing Instructor Y: I didn't get the names of all the medications. I got Lasix 20, didn't get the frequency of it, didn't get I think there were 3 meds, I didn't get the next medication at all, and then I got potassium 20 millequivalents qd. I got that this patient vomited twice, pulse, I've got a question mark, I'm not sure if said they took the pulse, or they didn't get the pulse . . . umm . . . I'm not sure what acting funny looks like? Umm, and not quite sure how that connects to seeing halos around the light.

Interviewer: So uh so these the fact that you didn't get the medications -

Nursing Instructor Y: Huge issue!

Interviewer: In your opinion, were there areas of language, not nursing practice but language, that could affect patient safety, in this example? Nursing Instructor X: Uh, yes, I think so, and I think it goes back to the the terms she used before: 'funny' and 'crazy' because those can be very umm, you know, funny what does that really mean, you know, is he unconscious umm, you know is he responding to verbal umm commands, to painful stimuli, like those all impact umm patient care.



Picture found online via 'labelled for non-commercial reuse' in Google Image search (photo credits on final slide)

Discussion

Talk to the person beside you for 3 minutes . . .

Q: What are some implications of these findings for english instruction in nursing education?



- At the risk of stating the obvious

 linguistic preparation of
 nursing students for whom
 English is an additional language
 will look differently in ELF
 contexts than in ENL ones.
- Listening instruction will aim not just for comprehension of a single 'standard' accent, but effective apprehension across a wide variety of Englishes.





Discussion

Talk to the person beside you for 3 minutes . . .

Q: YOU LOOK INTO A TYPICAL ESL CLASSTOOM, AND A LISTENING CLASS IS IN Progress. What do you see?



Implications

Effective listening pedagogy would seek to enhance listening skills that are interactional in nature, expanding traditional listening task constructs to include active listening techniques like clarification, summarizing and the like – from 'receptive orientation' toward a 'collaborative' or 'transformative' one.

(Rost, 2002, pp. 2-3)

The 'bottom up' development of lexical lists for nursing, based on frequency use, is an expanding area of application from the field of corpus linguistics (e.g., Mohamad & Ng, 2013) that presents possibilities for content-specific instruction across the curriculum.



Discussion

Talk to the person beside you for 3 minutes . . .

Q: LISTENING HAS BEEN CONSIDERED AN UNDERVALUED AND UNDERTAUGHT AREA OF LANGUAGE TEACHING, THE 'CINDERELLA OF THE FOUR MACRO-SKILLS' (FLOWERDEW & MILLER, 2005, P. XI).





Conclusion

In many cases ELT is seen only as a precursor to participation in nursing simulations; its usual relegation to 'foundation' programming results in a largely underutilized instructional opportunity for authentic, interactive and highly contextualized listening. As the findings of this study suggest, the neglect of communicative precision in ELF nursing instructional contexts is done at patient peril.

Questions and Comments?

Dr. M. Gregory (Greg) Tweedie
Werklund School of Education, University of Calgary
gregory.tweedie@ucalgary.ca



References

- Almutairi, A. F., & McCarthy, A. (2012). A multicultural nursing workforce and cultural perspectives in Saudi Arabia: An overview. *theHealth*, 3(3), 71-74.
- Bladd, J. (2008). Drug doses lost in translation. Retrieved June 6, 2013 from http://www.arabianbusiness.com/drug-doses-lost-in-translation-51171.html
- Buck, G. (2001). Assessing listening. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- El-Haddad, M. (2006). Nursing in the United Arab Emirates: An historical background. *International Nursing Review*, 53(4), 284-289.
- Packer, C., Labonte, R., & Runnels, V. (2009). Globalization and the cross-border flow of health workers. In R. Labonte, T. Schrecker, C. Packer & V. Runnels (Eds.), *Globalization and health: Pathways, evidence and policy* (pp. 213-234). New York: Routledge.
- Paschyn, C. (2012). Qatar: Anatomy of a globalized state. Think, (August), 16-20.
- Maher, J. (1987). English as an international language of medicine. Medical Education, 21(4), 283-284. doi:10.1111/j.1365-2923.1987.tb00363.x
- Mohamad, A. F., & Ng, Y. J. (2013). Corpus-based studies on nursing textbooks. Advances in Language and Literacy Studies, 4(2), 21-28.
- Rost, M. (2002). *Teaching and researching listening*. Harlow, UK: Longman.
- Sailaja, P. (2009). *Indian English*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.
- Sailaja, P. (2012). Indian English: Features and sociolinguistic aspects. Language and Linguistic Compass, 6(6), 359-370. doi:10.1002/lnc3.342

Picture credits

```
Slide 2: Picture found online via Creative Commons Google Image search at.ezygatar.com
Slide 3: Picture found online via Google Image search at yallatoursblog.com
Slide 4: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at Arab states of the Persian Gulf. (2016, February 28). In
  Wikipedia, The Free Encyclopedia. Retrieved 14:21, February 28, 2016, from
  https://en.wikipedia.org/w/index.php?title=Arab states of the Persian Gulf&oldid=707341140; flickr.com
Slide 7: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Milgram experiment
Slide 10: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at
  https://c1.staticflickr.com/3/2258/2293697518 8109375317 b.jpg
Slide 11: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at
  https://farm6.staticflickr.com/5276/14046136518 a415489e73 o d.jpg
Slide 12: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at
  https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/10/Mediciner (Small).jpg
Slide 14: Pictures found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at
  http://orig10.deviantart.net/169b/f/2008/004/e/2/captain_obvious_by_mobydisk.jpg;
  http://img03.deviantart.net/48dc/i/2011/143/d/5/thank you captain obvious by zekoalives-d3h2yyj.jpg
Slide 15: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search
  athttps://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/1/1c/Japanese_high_school_classroom.jpg
Slide 16: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at
  https://upload.wikimedia.org/wikipedia/commons/c/c3/ESL 1918.JPG
```

Slide 17: Picture found online via labelled for non-commercial reuse Google Image search at https://i.ytimg.com/vi/nyV5ZCwBjM4/hqdefault.jpg